

Town of Clifton & Town of Fine

Efficiency/Consolidation Study Committee Meeting

Meeting #14 – 3/23/2016 @ 6:00 p.m. @ the Town of Fine Municipal Building

Minutes

1. Attendees:

Committee Members: Brian Donovan (F), Chuck Hooven (C), Kelly Smith (C), Mark Hall (F), Roger Folsom (F), Jared Cooper (C)

Guests: AD Burr “Butch” Brown (F), Alberta Hartman (F), Tracy Typhair (F)

Consultants: Carrie Tuttle (DANC), Tom Sauter (DANC), Star Carter (DANC)

**Overall Objective for Evaluation of Alternatives Phase:
The Committee will develop a “base case” consolidated town
and evaluate alternatives outside of town consolidation**

2. Objectives for this Meeting:

1. Carrie led a review of the Wage & Benefit Cost Savings developed from Committee input at 2/24/16 meeting. The committee decided to make two changes:
 - Adjust the Highway Superintendent Wage for the Town of Fine to the 2015 wage, since the \$30,000 wage in 2014 was a special case for a retired employee and the true wage is \$50,000. The Wage was changed to \$50,000 and the benefits were adjusted to 28,158 to reflect the cost of benefits for a \$50,000/year position. A footnote will be included in the report explaining why this line item is referencing a 2015 number and not 2014.
 - Dog Control New Town Wage was adjusted to \$4,500 to reflect the increased work that will be required of the Dog Control Officer responsible for the larger new Town. It was also noted that all references for this position should be to Dog Control Officer and not Animal Control Officer since the position is not responsible for cats or other animals besides dogs.
2. Carrie led a review of the Contractual Cost Savings assumptions. The committee evaluated each line item and discussed as follows:
 - The committee decided to assume the higher cost of the 2 Towns where applicable to give the most conservative savings outcome. The higher cost was assumed for: Accounting

Software, Assessor Contractual Expenses, Code Enforcement Contractual Expenses, Legislative Board Contractual Expenses, and Superintendent of Highways Contractual.

- The average of the 2 Town costs was assumed for certain line items due to a large difference in the Town costs: The average was assumed for Municipal Association Dues, Supervisor Contractual Expenses and Clerk Contractual Expenses. Carrie will recalculate the Clerk's Contractual expenses to reduce mileage costs but not reduce postage costs, and also minus the cost of 1 BAS software license (\$630).
- The Fire Monitoring Expenses were added together, since the new costs would include all of the existing buildings, unless one or more of the buildings is no longer used.
- Law Contractual Expenses savings were assumed to be the contractual expenses that Clifton had in 2014, since the new Legal Services Wage now reflects a full wage instead of part of the wage coming from Contractual Expenses.
- The committee discussed the Auditor Contractual Expenses and decided that the expenses would be more than just what the Town of Fine pays currently, but since Clifton does not do an annual audit, they're not sure what the figure would be. They decided that there would be no savings for this item.

3. Confirm Tax Credits

- Besides the CETC, Carrie identified another state aid program related to consolidated assessing units. Star described the program details given to her by Joe Moorman at the NYS Office of Real Property. The State will reward municipalities for consolidating assessing units by paying them a one-time payment of up to \$7/parcel. The actual amount changes from year to year depending on program funding. The 2015 payment would have been \$5.29/parcel, and in 2014 it was \$3.19/parcel. If the Towns are not fully consolidated, this Consolidated Assessment Program (CAP) would be an option for improved efficiencies and a state aid payment. If the Towns consolidate later, Joe did not think that the Towns would have to pay the money back (as has happened when other municipalities have broken their assessing unit apart) because they would be consolidating and not splitting the assessment units apart. The committee will think about including this option in the alternatives report.








4. Identify Other Potential Service Delivery Efficiencies to be evaluated:

- Plow routing evaluation
- Building consolidation evaluation
- The committee did not have other ideas at this time but will email Carrie if they think of any before the next meeting

Carrie will make all the changes discussed to the Summary of Savings Worksheets and updated copies will be distributed to the committee. She reminded the committee that these documents and savings totals are likely to change as the committee continues to work through the alternatives, as other wage, benefit, and contractual savings are considered.

The agenda from the meeting has been updated to reflect the changes identified.

Summary of Tasks in this Phase of Study and Progress to Date	Status
<p>1. Brainstorm recommendations for alternative delivery of Town services</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Committee completed brainstorming session on January 27, 2016 • A summary of the discussion and recommendations was included in the meeting minutes 	Complete

<p>2. Categorize recommendations into specific budgets for potential cost savings to examine:</p> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-around; align-items: flex-start; text-align: center;"> <div data-bbox="162 772 414 1102">  </div> <div data-bbox="451 772 703 1102">  </div> <div data-bbox="740 772 992 1102">  <p data-bbox="740 1144 992 1281"> Plow Route Efficiency Eval Town Bldg Consolidation Eval Other Opportunities? </p> </div> <div data-bbox="1029 772 1281 1102">  </div> </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-around; align-items: center; margin-top: 10px;"> <div data-bbox="162 1144 414 1354">  </div> <div data-bbox="451 1144 703 1354">  </div> <div data-bbox="1029 1144 1281 1354">  </div> </div> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Committee developed base case scenario for personal services delivery at February 24, 2016 meeting. • From brainstorming session, other efficiency improvements that were identified and require additional exploration include: evaluating plow-routes under consolidated town scenario for potential efficiencies, evaluating potential cost savings from consolidation of town buildings (utilities, maintenance, etc.) <p><i>ANY OTHERS SERVICE DELIVERY EFFICIENCIES TO CONSIDER EVALUATING?</i></p>	In Process
---	------------

3. Analyze each recommendation: delivery method, cost, and cost savings.

- Each category will be examined separately
- Recommendations within each category will be analyzed to define:
 - How the service will be delivered
 - What the cost will be
 - Decide on method to determine projected/estimated salaries and costs
 - Calculate cost savings achieved
- Alternatives besides consolidation will be analyzed and defined once Base Case of full consolidation is evaluated so Committee understands potential savings and service delivery options that are viable without full consolidation

Progress

- Wage Savings estimated to be \$167,532¹
 - Assumes Employee Benefits = 47.71% (avg. of 2 Towns)
- Contractual Savings estimated to be \$18,988
- Tax Credit
 - CETC estimated to be = \$353,298
 - Using 2015 Tax Levy
- Other
 - *Other efficiency evaluations (i.e., plow routing, building consolidation, etc.) could have additional impacts on Wage & Contractual Savings*

TOTAL ESTIMATED ANNUAL TAX SAVINGS FROM CONSOLIDATION IDENTIFIED SO FAR = \$539,818

- Consolidation of Real Property Tax Assessment & Equalization;
 - Option without consolidation
 - State aid *UP TO* \$7 parcel, past years has varied from \$3.00-\$7.00

= (1,089 + 1,930 parcels) x \$3-\$7/parcel = \$9,057-\$21,113

In Process

¹ AUD data from 2014 is utilized to compute wage and most contractual cost savings to be consistent with financials reported in Existing Conditions Report, unless noted otherwise. Exceptions will be noted in the final report.

<p>NYS Office of Real Property Services</p> <p>Local governments can now take advantage of the Consolidation Incentive Aid that is offered through the Office of Real Property Services (ORPS). The objective of the program is to reduce the number of assessing jurisdictions in New York State in order to improve efficiency in the administration of the real property tax. According to the guidelines available on the agency's website, two or more assessing units are eligible to receive a one-time payment of \$7 per parcel if they assess all property at a uniform percentage and merge their assessment functions.³³</p> <p>According to ORPS, the program has resulted in moderate success with 75 assessing units having opted to coordinate their assessing into 32 Coordinated Assessing Programs since 1995.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is Committee interested in identifying this as a recommendation for potential cost savings and efficiency improvement, regardless of outcome of consolidation? 	
<p>4. Draft Alternatives Report with the recommendations and details</p>	<p>In Process</p>

Future Meeting Schedule

Kick Off Meeting	January 28, 2015
Demographics & Taxes	February 25, 2015
Services Provided: Highway Department Part I	March 25, 2015
Services Provided: Highway Department Part II	April 22, 2015
Services Provided: Fire Department	May 27, 2015
Services Provided: General Fund Town Services – Library, Arena, Golf Course, Dog Control, Court, etc.	June 24, 2015
Services Provided: Water/Sewer	July 22, 2015
Personnel	August 26, 2015
Finances and Budgets	September 23, 2015
Review Draft "Existing Conditions/What Exist" Report & Plan for Public Informational Meeting #1	November 23, 2015
Review PowerPoint and Draft "Existing Conditions/What Exist" Report for Public Informational Meeting #1	January 4, 2016
Informational Meeting #1	January 6, 2016
Evaluation of Alternatives	January 27, 2016
Evaluation of Alternatives - Wages & Benefits	February 24, 2016
Evaluation of Alternatives - Contractual Expenses, Other Efficiency	March 23, 2016

Improvements & Tax Credits	
Evaluation of Alternatives – Quantify Other Efficiency Improvements, Evaluate Alternatives outside of town consolidation	April 27, 2016
Evaluation of Alternatives – Draft Report	May 25, 2016
Evaluation of Alternatives – Finalize Draft Report and Prep for 2 nd Public Meeting	June 22, 2016
Public Informational Meeting #2	July 2016
Implementation Plan - Recommendations & Final Report	August 2016
Public Information Meeting/Hearing	September 2016